EFFECTIVENESS OF EVALUATION OF ELECTRONIC IDENTITY CARD (E-ID) POLICY IN CIMAHI CITY, WEST JAVA PROVINCE, INDONESIA

Poni Sukaesih Kurniati [*], **Budiman Rusli** [**], **Entang Adhy Muhtar** [**], **Sintaningrum** [**]

[*] Ph.D. Candidate in Public Administation, Padjadjaran Univesity, Bandung Indonesia

[**] Lecturer in Public Administration, Doctoral Program, Padjadjaran Univesity, Bandung Indonesia

ABSTRACT. *The phenomenon of the problem in this study is related to effectiveness in policy evaluation Electronic Identity Card (e-ID) in Cimahi is not optimal. This can be seen from the achievement of the policy objectives of the e-ID card that has not been fully realized in order to build an accurate database population and improve public services in Cimahi. The method used is descriptive qualitative approach. The technique of collecting data through observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation. The research instrument in this study is the researchers themselves, whereas the key informant is a team of evaluators e-ID card, and informants are supporters of Parliament elements, sub-district officials, village officials, Operator e-ID card and e-ID cards compulsory community. The results showed that the policy of e-ID in Cimahi is still not effective, it is seen from the impact resulting from the policy of e-ID card is still not visible. A team of evaluators in the evaluation of policies implemented e-ID card is limited only see the target of a recording made public as well as the distribution of e-ID cards to the public. Thus the nature of the e-ID card must provide value benefits to society yet to be seen.*

KEYWORDS: Effectiveness, Policy Evaluation, Electronic Identity Card (e-Id)

INTRODUCTION

Currently, the development of information technology so rapidly in many areas of life. In the areas of governance, too, where every government affairs now based electronics, or better known as electronic government (e-gov). One of the e-gov applications are implemented in Indonesia is a resident of Electronic Identity Card (e-ID). e-ID is the identity of the population which includes demographic identity number (NIK), which is unique, distinctive, singular, can not be duplicated. E-ID card was born in Indonesia was motivated by the problems of duplication identity population, resulting in inaccurate population data that will ultimately threaten the country's security.

The function of the e-ID card is a valid identity national identity so as to create the accuracy of population data to support development programs. While the benefits of e-ID card as an identity other than the identity of a single, can not be forged, can not be duplicated, and can be used to access public services from government. Moreover, according to Article 13 of Law No. 23 In 2006, NIK in the e-ID card will be used as the basis for the issuance of a passport, driver's license (SIM), a Taxpayer Identification Number (NPWP), insurance policies, certificates of land rights and the issuance of other identity documents.

E-ID card launched in Indonesia since 2006, but has established and implemented in 2009 by Based on Law Number 23 year 2006 Jo. Law Number 24 year 2013, which was then followed up by Government Regulation Number 37 Year 2007, Presidential Decree Number 26 Year 2009 jo Presidential Decree Number 35 year 2010, the interior minister Regulation Number 38 Year 2009 jo interior minister Regulations Number 6 year 2011 and Regulation interior minister Number 9 year 2011. The implementation of e-ID in Indonesia is carried out through two periods. The first period implemented in 2011 consisting of 197 districts / cities throughout Indonesia. Cimahi included in the first period of the implementation of the e-ID card and become a pilot project in West Java Province. Implementation of e-ID in Cimahi implemented in 3 districts spread over 15 villages.

E-ID card held in Cimahi began in October 2011, with a target at that moment at the end of 2012 all mandatory e-ID card as much as 446.981 people have already have an e-ID card. But at the end of 2012 was only about 66.64% which is already recording an e-ID card. Even until the end of 2013 the target has not been achieved. Therefore, Cimahi municipal government working hard to complete the rest of compulsory e-ID card that has not been recorded. Problems in the implementation of e-ID appears, because based on the observation of researchers, policy evaluation of e-ID in Cimahi who do not yet effective, it is seen from the results of the evaluation team of evaluators who only see the effectiveness of the policy of e-ID card is limited to the target e-ID card recording, distributing e-ID card and absorption alone. Results of the evaluation did not see the extent to which the effectiveness of e-ID card policy implemented in Cimahi related to the impact or effect of which is supposed to be generated from this policy of e-ID card.

Based on the above problems, the researchers are interested to discuss the effectiveness of the policy evaluation identity cards electronically (e-id) in Cimahi with the formulation of the problem, namely how to effectiveness in policy evaluation identity cards electronically (e-ID) in Cimahi City,West Java Province?

LITERATURE REVIEW

According to Rosenbloom (2002: 390) analysis and evaluation of the implementation of policy is needed by politicians and public administrators, because these two fields provide knowledge about the design and effects of policies (2002: 414). In line with the Rosenbloom, the paper initially Nagel (1990: ix) identifies five key elements in the policy evaluation. namely: (a) objectives, including barriers and emphasis on specific objectives normative; (b) policies, programs, projects, decisions, choices, alternatives exist to achieve the objectives that have been set; (c) The relations between the policies and objectives, including the relationships that are built based on intuition. authorities, statistics, observation, deduction. conjecture, or other means; (d) Conclusions while about a particular policy is best policy to be adopted; and (e) determining what will be done.

According to Dunn (2003: 608) evaluation is an assessment, grading or rating and can also be interpreted as a judgment or assessment, words that express an attempt to analyze the results of the policy in terms of unit value. In a more specific sense, an evaluation with regard to the production of information regarding the value and benefits of a policy. When the results of

the policy in fact has value, it is because these results contribute to the goals or objectives. Furthermore, according to Dunn (2003: 609) evaluation plays a major function in policy analysis, as follows:

1. Evaluation provide information valid and reliable about the performance of the policy, which is about how far the need, value and opportunity has been achieved through public action. In this case the evaluation reveals how far certain objectives (eg health improvement) and specific targets have been achieved.

2. Evaluation contribute to the clarification and critique of the values of the underlying objectives and targets. Value clarified by defining and operating objectives and targets. Value was also criticized by systematically asking propriety goals and targets in relation to the problems addressed. In asking the propriety goals and objectives, the analyst can examine alternative sources of value and grounding them in various forms of rationality.

3. Evaluation contribute to the application of methods of analysis other policies, especially for the "formulation of the problem" and "recommendation". Information about the adequacy of policy performance can contribute to the reformulation of policy issues. By demonstrating that the objectives and targets need to be defined. Evaluations also can also contribute to the definition of policy alternatives that are new or revised policy by showing that previously favored policy alternatives need to be removed and replaced with another.

Anderson (2003: 151) said policy evaluation is "the appraisal or assessment of the policy, its content Including implementation and impact". Therefore, according to Anderson then, as an activity that is both functional then the policy evaluation is as important as the policy itself. As for what is meant by an activity that is both functional is the evaluation policy is not only carried out at the final stage, but it is done on the entire policy process, so that the evaluation of the policy will cover the entire process starting from the formulation of policy issues, programs proposed to solve policy issues, and the implementation phase of the policy impact.

The concepts described above, can be correlated with the thinking of Mustopadidjaja (2003: 46) which further explains the evaluation policy, namely that of public policy evaluation in the study of public policy is one of the stages of the public policy process. he said later, that policy evaluation is to assess the activities or see the success and failure of a policy.

In practice, according Hatry (1976: 323) that:

> *"Policy Evaluation Efforts Often face an uphill battle, from gaining agreement to undertake the evaluation, through planning and conducting the evaluation, to using the results. Much can go wrong during the process of evaluation"*

View Hatry stressed that policy evaluation efforts often face a struggle which is quite heavy, starting from the approval of the evaluation plan to implement the results of the evaluation where so many mistakes done during the evaluation process.

Dye (1992: 354) complete the evaluation of the definition of policies by arguing that "Policy evaluation is learning about the consequences of public policy". The definition indicates that the evaluation of public policy is a study on the consequences of public policy.

According to Fischer (2007: 294), there are 3 types of policy evaluation is ex-ante evaluation, ongoing evaluation and Ex-post evaluation.

1. Ex-ante evaluation of policy evaluation is done before the policy is implemented. Hypothetically evaluation of this type is intended to anticipate and provide an initial assessment of the estimate of the effect or impact and consequences of the policies that are planned or have been assigned. The goal is to provide relevant information to the policy or the policy-making process is ongoing. Ex-ante evaluation is an important instrument of determining the choice of a wide range of policy options that exist. Evaluation of this type also provide analysis of the impact on the environment policies.

2. Ongoing Evaluation is to identify and measure the impact and results of the programs that are running. The essence of ongoing evaluation is to provide relevant information, back to the policy implementation process, particularly at certain stages of policy implementation as the information can be used to repair, revision, "straighten out" back in the direction of the policy implementation process really want to achieve. Associated with this type of evaluation, monitoring is also categorized as an ongoing evaluation. Monitoring is an evaluation procedure that aims to (descriptively) identifying and providing appropriate data support, which can be applied if possible. Monitoring also presents indicators for measuring the impact or effect of the policy is being implemented. In the concept of New Public Management, the use of performance indicators become a very important concept.

3. Ex-post evaluation which is the classic variant of policy evaluation. This evaluation is intended to provide an assessment of the level of achievement of the objectives and the impact of policies that have been implemented. It is also an evaluation of the result of the policy.

Stufflebeam argued CIPP model consists of four types of evaluation, Context Evaluation, Input Evaluation, Process Evaluation, and Product Evaluation. Meanwhile, Bardach, in Patton and Sawicki (1986: 156-167) suggests four basic criteria of evaluation of the policy: "Technical feasibility, political viability, economy and financial possibility and administrative operability".

policy evaluation according to Dunn (2003: 610) can be used six criteria: effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and appropriateness. Meanwhile Jones (1984: 199) suggests systematic measures proposed Jones covering several functional activities, namely the specification, assessment, analysis and recommendations.

Dunn (2003: 610) states that the effectiveness is to see whether the desired results to be achieved. Efficiency is to see "how much effort is needed to achieve the desired results". Sufficiency is to examine questions how far the desired results solve a problem.

 Effectiveness focused on whether the proposed policy or program will have, or have the desired effect. Some key dimensions of effectiveness criteria whether the effect of directly or indirectly from the program or policy, long-term or short-term, measurable or not, and insufficient or inadequate as stated Bardach (Patton and Sawicki, 1986: 157) "Several important dimensions of effectiveness criteria are Whether the program or policy effects are direct or indirect, long-term or short-term, quantifiable or not, and adequate or inadequate ".

METHODOLOGY

Problem formulation disclosed in the introduction of "how the effectiveness of the policy evaluation e-id in Cimahi", the word "how" will try to explain why things appear, and in a qualitative study of the word "how" it reflects the thinking of a more open, as has been said by Creswell (2013: 138) that:

> *Qualitative research question are open ended, evolving, and non directional.They restate the purpose of the study in more specific terms and typically start with a word such as what or how rather than why in order to explore a central phenomenon.*

Based on the formulation of the problem and research objectives, this study used a qualitative approach and descriptive analysis method. A qualitative approach is deemed more relevant research is used in policy evaluation to observe the dig, revealed comprehensively how the effectiveness of policy evaluation e-id in Cimahi.

Data types in this study consisted of primary data and secondary data. Data was collected by observation, in-depth interview, documentation study. Informants empirically composed of key informants that the team evaluator of e-ID and informant support of elements of Parliament, the sub-district officials, village officials, operators of e-ID card, as well as the community. The research instrument in this study are researchers. Data validity testing techniques performed through source triangulation. In this study, the data that has been obtained through interview, observation and documentation then analyzed using three stages, namely *reading the transcript, categorizing,* dan *contextualizing.*

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Effectiveness focused on whether the proposed policy or program will have, or have the desired effect. Some key dimensions of effectiveness criteria whether the effect of directly or indirectly from the program or policy, long-term or short-term, measurable or not, and insufficient or inadequate as stated Bardach (Patton and Sawicki, 1986: 157) "Several important dimensions of effectiveness criteria are Whether the program or policy effects are direct or indirect, long-term or short-term, quantifiable or not, and adequate or inadequate ".

Thus the effectiveness see how far the results of the policy of e-ID achieve the desired goal, for it is necessary to know what the objectives of the policy of this e-ID card. Effective means that the program can achieve the desired objectives. Often, however, achievement of the objectives can not always be seen simply because of the existence of the policy, often many other factors such as social, economic influence and needs to be aware of other factors such as culture typical location may all play a role in the success of the policy at that location , Other factors that contribute to the achievement of the policy objectives of e-ID in Cimahi also must not be separated from social and cultural conditions. Cimahi with the conditions in part of its territory many urban communities and on the other hand there are some groups of people faiths is one thing that should be evaluated to see how far the ineffectiveness of the policy e-ID card in Cimahi.

Based on interviews with the evaluator that is basically an evaluation of the effectiveness of the carried out only to see the target of recording. In fact, if explored further the effectiveness of this to be seen from different viewpoints. It As stated Jones (1984: 199) says that policy evaluation is an activity that aims to assess the benefits of a policy. Evaluation of policies aimed at improving the effectiveness and to determine whether the public policy goals that have been executed can be realized as expected.

Thus, it should be evaluated in terms of overall effectiveness targets not only the recording but what is the purpose of e-ID card policy has been achieved or not, let alone E-ID has been running for four years. According to the observation by the authors examine the evaluation report evaluators, policy e-ID card in Cimahi has been evaluated by a team of evaluators, but the evaluation has not been effective, so that the original purpose of the e-ID card policy has not been fully achieved. E-ID policy evaluation conducted by a team of evaluators has not been effective, as seen from the target recording only the basic team of evaluators in the evaluation of the effectiveness of the policy's e-ID card. According to the writer, the effective evaluation must look at whether the direct and indirect effects, whether the effects of long term and short term, the effect tangible and intangible in order to improve the performance of policies e-ID card.

Referring to what is described above, then the evaluation should be able to see the direct effects expected from the policy's e-ID card is to build a database of accurate population with no duplication identity population so as to create an orderly administration of population and improve public services. Indirect effect that the pubic sector organizations and the private sector will also feel the benefits of e-ID cards with the accuracy of the data therein. Based on observations, accurate population data base will occur because NIK owned by the society does not allow people to have multiple identities. At the time of inputting will be directly detected when people have had e-ID, the system will automatically reject it. In the private sector organizations will gain indirect effects of e-ID cards, with NIK they already have and the data electronics contained in the e-ID card can be checked with the card reader therefore the e-ID card will provide accurate data.

Long-term effects of e-ID card, according to an analysis by researchers is support to national development, including the development in Cimahi. This demographic data can be used for Cimahi government to carry out the construction. While the short-term effects are public services, development planning, budget allocation, development of democracy, law enforcement and crime prevention as mandated in Law number 24 Year 2013.

Based on interviews with informants said that the e-ID card program that's good, because the direction of this program to the public in order to avoid duplication of population identity. Therefore, the issue of e-ID card is very crucial because it required 1) for controlling the population problem, 2) to make the data more valid election, 3) makes it easy to monitor citizens 4) if there is a program of the government will not be misplaced.

Measured the effects of these policies e-ID card is the number of accurate population data, causing data accuracy is also related to the amount of the target population as well as the amount of development budget allocation for development activities in Cimahi. While it is not measurable effect of e-ID card is a sense of security, especially for people Cimahi and the

Indonesian people in general because of the e-ID card is of course the state security will be increased.

Adequate effects of e-ID cards are no longer people who have multiple identities population thus creating accurate population data. While the effects are inadequate from the e-ID card is still the community in Cimahi who are not satisfied with the e-ID card is because the religion column emptied so difficult to gain access to public and private services that need the attention of Cimahi municipal government.

Based on what has been described by the author, related to the effects of e-ID card, should indeed Cimahi municipal government in this case the evaluator e-ID evaluation related to the effectiveness of this where Nugroho (2003: 179) states the effectiveness of these include "1) Does the policy is right, 2) Proper implementation, 3) Appropriate targets, 4) Right environment "

From the above opinion, then if will make an assessment of the effectiveness of the course that must be answered is whether the e-ID card policy is appropriate that the assessment would look at the contents of the policy that should be loaded with things that can resolve the problem. When examined, basically e-ID cards with the electronic recording namely fingerprints with iris indicate that it's all in an effort to overcome in order to avoid duplication of population identity. In connection with this, the informant of the sub-district officials said that" the e-ID card is good, but maybe because it is also faced with various constraints. E-ID card was no obstacle, do not know whether the method is wrong, the system is wrong, but not the e-ID card program is wrong but the technical nature".

According to the authors, e-ID card policy is relevant to the problem to be solved, but must be addressed technically for other things including an evaluation conducted by a team of evaluators. E-ID since the year 2013 is declared valid for life as long as no changes to the data of the population concerned. If there is a change of data, meaning that the person concerned must make application for the manufacture of a new e-ID card. Moving on from this, the authors saw that the evaluation of policies e-ID card is not yet provide maximum results. Yet according to the authors to think in the future, the data of ID is not necessary to load the identity so complete as address, marital status, occupation and religion. Authors have thought so because when people move addresses only, for example, to move the location of residence was automatically he must replace its e-ID card.

Thus, why not only the presence of NIK is maximized, which is clear and singular nature remains unchanged. Demographic data are always dynamic in nature, according to the author just save it on the server, no need to be physically presented in the e-ID card. Population data of course will be accessible by the NIK, then surely Cimahi government should immediately and simultaneously build NIK as a basis for public service.

In order to see the effectiveness of the evaluation, "proper implementation" can be used as a measure of the effectiveness of the policy evaluation e-ID card. E-ID card is indeed the policy of the central government, but Cimahi as cities implement policies e-ID card should conduct an evaluation of the policy's e-ID card, so that the results of the evaluation of this evaluator team must be able to provide policy recommendations for the improvement of policies e- ID card in the future

According to the results of interviews with informants stated "In general e-ID card is good, but this is too daring, in all these years to be completed, so it lacks infrastructure. The team is already working evaluator assesses the policy's e-ID card. According to the results of the evaluation, judging from the data is more accurate, and there are no duplicate data. So the government that if the plan was thorough, clear, prepare mentality ".

Based on what the informant said above, it appears that the evaluation of e-ID card has not been done according to plan which mature in Cimahi. According to the authors, the evaluation of the policy's e-ID card should indeed be done in stages, with a look at all the aspects that play a role in realizing the e-ID policy performance reaches its destination. This evaluation must be accompanied by the readiness and capability of the team evaluator in Cimahi who perform their duties.

Targeted in the e-ID policy evaluation must also be realistically constructed by looking at all the potential available resources. If the results of the evaluation of a team of evaluators viewed from the target recording e-ID, if observed according to the authors so high. Results of the evaluation at the end of 2011 the target is not achieved recording of 446.981 inhabitants mandatory e-ID only reached 53.517 people (11.9%). Because in the first year the target is not reached, then based on the Circular of the Ministry of Interior Number 471.13 / 5079 / SJ dated December 20, year 2011, recording e-ID card was extended until April 30, 2012 to complete a number of compulsory ID cards as many as 361.114 inhabitants of compulsory ID cards as much as 446. 981 inhabitants.

Therefore, the mechanism of the recording service in 2012 that changed along with the addition of the recording equipment is done in Cimahi as the efforts to achieve the target of compulsory ID cards. Moreover, in order to expedite the publishing services e-ID en masse in 2011 and 2012, particularly for the people who already live outside the domicile of origin, based on Law Number 23 year 2006 mandated that the implementation of the registration of the population based on the principle of domicile or dwelling on the events of the population. Furthermore, on Presidential Regulation Number 25 year 2008 stipulated that the census conducted in the department of population and civil registration duties include the area of domicile or residence of the population. Based on this, the e-ID card as the output of resident registration issued in place of domicile or residence of the population.

According to the results of the evaluation team evaluator, at the end of April 2012 which is the deadline of the end of the recording, the target is not reached its full potential, but only reached 66.64% of the remaining target of compulsory ID cards in 2012 or 82.48% of the total cumulative compulsory ID cards. Not achieving the target of mass recording in 2012, certainly indicates the ineffectiveness of the evaluation by a team of evaluators e-ID card. Based on information from informants team of evaluators and operator e-ID cards, e-ID card policy in Cimahi is based on SOP issued by the interior ministry, but the SOP when applied on the ground is not suitable. According to the SOP recording time per person is five minutes, but in fact is not enough time for a variety of technical problems in the field. Technical obstacles, among other devices, networks, human resources and the ability of different skin conditions, so that the process of recording fingerprints takes a long time. This is certainly an impact on the current division of e-ID card to the community Cimahi, because there must be matching fingerprints. In addition, according to a team of evaluators delays in printing and

distribution of e-ID card from the central government to Cimahi foreshadowed problems of e-ID card in Cimahi.

Based on the results of the evaluation team of evaluators who performed at the discretion of the E-ID card in 2012, then in 2013 at the time of entry a regular recording, of course, the recording process is ongoing. However, in 2013 it could be said the recording was done without a target, clear the rest of the compulsory ID cards that must be recorded amounted to 122.000 inhabitants. Accordingly, Cimahi municipal government was only able to reach the target of 90% compulsory ID cards at the end of 2014, while the E-ID cards that have been distributed to the public is as much as 72%.

According to the authors, the results of the evaluation conducted by a team of evaluators e-ID card in Cimahi is already done but not yet effective, it can be seen from the results of the evaluation are merely chasing the target recording from year to year, but without seeing the root of the problems in the evaluation that has been done, thus re-evaluated when results are still the same is not as expected. If we analyze further, the authors see that this evaluation has not been effective because it has not been done in a planned, purposeful and regular.

The interaction between policy makers with policy implementation also helped create the effectiveness of the policy's e-ID card. The relationship between the central government and the government of Cimahi should be evaluated to see how far the effectiveness of the policy e-ID achieved. According to the authors, communication established between the central government and local governments have a role in the performance of the policy's e-ID card. Therefore, the consistency and clarity of the information to be fostered between the two. Based on the results of interviews known that Cimahi municipal government has not been fully created good communication, it is seen from the mass resignation recording time. In addition, changes to the e-ID card validity period and invalidates the previous ID, also change of e-ID card printing also indicates that the environment has influenced policy in the policy's e-ID card. Based on this, the authors saw no one form of communication that are less effective, so the impact on the effectiveness of policies e-ID card is not achieved optimally. This shall be the basis also for the team of evaluators to evaluate this side, however, because the e-ID card policy will succeed must be supported by effective communication.

In addition to the interaction between the central and municipal government Cimahi, West Java provincial government would also be a highlight of the results of the evaluation team evaluator's policy of e-ID card. According to the informant of the team evaluator, the field of population in West Java province less contribute to the e-ID. This happens because the institutional organization is under the provincial secretary. Whereas in the Law number 24 year 2013 clearly stated the authority of the Provincial Government related to this population. The external environment also contribute to the effectiveness of the e-ID, which is related to the perception of public opinion will be the policy community Cimahi e-ID card. Interprective institutions with regard to the interpretation of strategic institutions in society, such as the mass media played a role in the success of the policy's e-ID card.

CONCLUSION

Based on the description above, the authors see that in terms of effectiveness, the evaluation of e-ID card policy has not been effective. Results of the evaluation of policies E-ID card in Cimahi municipal government only look from the target of the recording and distribution without regard to the effect of the future that would have resulted from a policy which should provide benefits to the community as well as the value of public services and private institutions. effectiveness in policy evaluation e-id in Cimahi not fully supported by all the resources, therefore, this policy only solve some of the problems associated with identity population demography. Thus, the existence of e-ID card is currently only limited self-identity just is not different from the previous identity cards.

REFERENCES

Anderson, James E. (2003). Encyclopedia of Educational Evaluation: Concepts and Technique for Evaluating Education and Training Program, San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass Publisher

Creswell, John W. (2013). *Research Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed.* Terjemahan Achmad Fawaid. Yogyakarta:Pustaka Pelajar

Creswell, John W. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry &Research Design.* Uk New Delhi- California: Sage Publications

Dunn, William. (2003). Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik (terjemahan).Yogyakarta : Gadjah Mada University Press.

Dunn, William.(1981). Public Policy Analysis: An Introduction. United States of America : Englewood Cliffs, Prentice Hall Inc.

Dye, Thomas. R. (1992). *Understanding Public Policy*. Seventh Edition. Englewood Cliffs. New Jersey: Prentice Hall

Fischer. Frank. (2007). *Handbook of Public Policy*: *Theory, Politic*, *and Methods*. New York: CRS Press.

Hattry, Harry, Louis Blair, Donald Fisk and Wayne Kimmel. (1976). *Program Analysis for State and Local Government*. Washington DC: The Urban Institute

Jones, Charles, O. (1991). *Kebijakan Publik.* terjemahan Edi Istanto. Jakarta: PT. Rajawali.

Jones, Charles, O. (1984). *An Introduction to The Study of Public Policy: Third Edition*., California : Brooks/Cole Publishing Company..

Mustopadidjaja AR,. (2000). Perkembangan Penerapan Studi Kebijakan. Jakarta: LAN.

Mustopadidjaja. AR. (2003). Manajemen Proses Kebijakan Publik ; Formulasi, Implementasi dan Evaluasi Kinerja. Jakarta : LAN-RI dan Duta Foundation.

Nagel, Stuart.S. (1990). *Public Policy Evaluation*. New York: Marcel Dekker

Nugroho, Riant. 2009. *Public Policy*. Yogyakarta : UGM Press.

Patton, Carl V and Sawicki, David.S. (1986). *Basic Methods of Policy Analysis and Planning.* New York: prentice hall: Englewood Cliffs.

Rosenbloom, David H. (2002). Public Administration Understanding: Politics and Law in The Public Sector. McGraw-Hill., Inc. New York.

Rusli, H. Budiman. (2013). *Kebijakan Publik Membangun Pelayanan Publik Yang Responsif.* Bandung: Hakim Publishing.

Rusli, H. Budiman. (2014). Isu-*Isu Krusial Administrasi Publik Kontemporer.* Bandung:Lepsindo

Saefullah, H.A.Djadja. (2007). *Pemikiran Kontemporer Administrasi Publik, Prespektif Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Dalam Era Desentralisasi*., Bandung : LP3AN FISIP UNPAD.

Stufflebeam, Daniel L.(2002). *Evaluation Modals Viewpoint on Educational and Second Edition*. United States of America: Kluwer Academic Publisher.