Miranda Risang Ayu

# GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS PROTECTION IN INDONESIA BASED ON CULTURAL RIGHTS APPROACH



Nagara

9/6/2012



# GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS PROTECTION IN INDONESIA BASED ON CULTURAL RIGHTS APPROACH

24/1-202

MIRANDA RISANG AYU



GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS PROTECTION IN INDONESIA BASED ON CULTURAL RIGHTS APPROACH © Miranda Risang Ayu

Hak cipta dilindungi undang-undang All rights reserved

Diterbitkan Pertama Kali oleh NAGARA Jl Veteran I/25 Jakarta Pusat Tlp. 021-3840127 email: redaksi@nagaraonline.com website: www.nagaraonline.com

Supervisi: Taufik Rahzen Desain sampul: Eddy Susanto Desain isi: Kalam Jauhari

Perpustakaan Nasional: Katalog Dalam Terbitan (KDT)

Geographical Indications Protection in Indonesia Based on Cultural Rights Approach
Miranda Risang Ayu. – Jakarta
NAGARA, 2009
438 hlm.; 15 x 24 cm
ISBN: 978-979-1436-08-3
1. Hukum
I. Miranda.

1. Cultural Rights. I. Judul. II. Miranda Risang Ayu.

814

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to:

Australian Agency for International Development (Aus AID)

• The Faculty of Law and the University of Graduate School of University of Technology Sydney, New South Wales, Australia

• The Faculty of Law, the Intellectual Property Rights Office, and the Human Rights Association of University of Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

• Directorate General of Intellectual Property Rights, Ministry of Justice and Human Rights, Tangerang, Indonesia.

#### I am indebted to:

- My Principal Supervisor Prof. Philip Griffith for his stimulating and inspiring ideas, nurturing commitment and genuine compassion, and my Alternate Supervisor Mr. Bill Childs, LLB, GCLB for his kindness and patience.
- Prof. Lesley Hitchens, Prof. Jill McKeough, Prof. Sam Blay, Prof. Kathy Bowrey, Assoc. Prof. Rocque Reynolds, Prof. Tony Moon, Prof. Louise Young and Ms. Lynn Freeman, Assoc. Prof. Simon Rice and Dr. George Tian for their concerns in the process of my candidature.
- Hon. Judge Prof. Mieke Komar Kantaatmadja, Prof. Endang Sae-

fullah, Prof. Abdullah Himendra, Prof. Eddy Damian, Prof. Ahmad M. Ramli, Prof. Rukmana Amanwinata, Prof. Sri Soemantri, Hon. Judge Prof. Bagir Manan, Prof. Otje Salman, Prof. Lili Rasjidi, Prof. I Gde Pantja Astawa and Prof. Man Suparman for their understandings before and during my candidature.

Mr. Indra Perwira, SH, MH, Mr. Rudi Rizki, SH, LLM, Mrs. Susi Dwi Harijanti, SH, LLM, and all colleagues and friends in the Constitutional Law and International Law Sections of University of Padjadjaran, and friends in the Research Students Bay of the Faculty of Law, University of Technology Sydney, for their moral supports.

• Mr. Budhi Supriatna and Mr. Hidayat Mukti, Mr. Taufik Rahzen and staffs of Blora Institute, Dr. Richard Hamilton, Mr. Stuart Sharman and Ms. Suzanne McLoughlin from Wynn's Coonawarra Estate, the owner of Balnaves Coonawarra Wines Mr. Doug Balnaves, Goulburn Rosarian Mr. and Mrs Max and Jane Ryan, and Ms. Debbie Sibbick from Goulbourn Mulwaree Council, for their helps in field research, and also Ms. Billie Vlies and Greg Hempshire for their helps in library research.

French teachers Mrs. Muriel Bazin and Mrs. Hudhudi, and English teacher Ms. Amanda Greenhalgh for their helps in languages.

 Valda Cooper, Mrs. Amrita Mukhopadhyay, Mrs. Nola Grierson, Ms Leanne Palmer, and especially Ms. Andrea Myles for their helps in procedural matters.

My husband Nanang Burhan, my children Sadra, Majma, Mahatma, my parents Adri and Runi Palar, my brothers and sisters Alvin-Novi and Xenia-Radwin, may cousin Karmen, my auntie Kumalawati and family, my uncle Sidhi and family, and all members of my extended family and family-in-law in Indonesia for their endless loves, encouragements and helps.

• Dr. Evi Lanasier, for being my closest friend with real helps and concern, especially in the completion of this research.

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Tables and Charts »	16
List of Maps » 17	
List of Pictures » 18	
Abstract » 21	

# CHAPTER I

Introduction » 24

#### Background » 24

Geographical Indications in the TRIPS Agreement  $\,>\,25$  Geographical Indications in Other International

Conventions » 27

Protectable Elements » 30

Geographical Indications Protection in Developed Countries » 33

Geographical Indications Protection in South East Asian Countries » 33

Geographical Indications Implementation Problem in Indonesia » 35

Traditional Knowledge Protection Problems » 37

The Cultural Rights Based Approach » 37

The Advantages of Using Cultural Rights Based Approach in Indonesia » 37

Research Questions » 38 Aims and Objectives » 39 Output » 39 Hypotheses » 39 Methodology » 40

> Types of Data » 40 Methods of Data Collection » 40

Library and On-Line Research » 40

Field Research » 40

Areas of Data Collection » 41

Institutional Data Areas » 41

Market Polling Areas » 41

Focus Group Discussions or Individual Interviews » 41 Methods of Data Analysis » 43

#### CHAPTER II

# GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS PROTECTION IN THE CONTEXT OF

INTERNATIONAL LAW » 46

# Geographical Indications in the TRIPS Agreement of 1995 » 46

The Brief History of TRIPS Agreement of 1995 » 46

The International Trade Organization » 48

The Birth of the TRIPS Agreement » 49

Geographical Indications in the TRIPS Agreement » 52

Geographical Indications as the TRIPS In-Built Agenda in the WTO Ministerial Conferences » 9

# Geographical Indications in Other International

#### Conventions » 61

The Paris Convention for the Protection of Industrial Property 1883 » 61

The Madrid Agreement, 1891 and The Madrid Protocol concerning the International Registration of Marks, 1989 » 64

The Madrid Agreement, 1891 for the Repression of False or Deceptive Indications of Source on Goods » 65

The Lisbon Agreement for the Protection of Appellations of Origin and Their International Registration, 1958 » 66

The Stresa Convention for the Use of Appellation of Origin and Denomination of Cheeses, 1951 » 68

#### Legal Concepts related to Geographical Indications in International Conventions » 68

A Comparison between the Concepts of Geographical Indications, Appellation of Origins, Designation of Origins and Indication of Source » 68

Geographical Indications » 70

Appellation of Origins » 72

Designation of Origins » 74

Indication of Source » 76

Legal Concepts in Trade Mark Law and Practice concerning Geographical Indications » 78

Collective Marks » 9

Certification Marks » 9

Legal Concept of Anti Unfair Competition concerning Geographical Indications » 79

The Common Law's Tort of Passing-Off » 80

The Extension of the Meaning of Producers and Public of a Geographical Indication » 82

The Extension of the Passing-Off Concept » 84

# Protectable Elements in Geographical Indications » 85

The Meaning of 'Indications which Identify a Good' » 86 The Meaning of 'a Good' » 87

- The Meaning of 'Originating in the Territory of a Member, or a Region or Locality in that Territory' » 88
- The Meaning of 'Quality, Reputation or Other
- Characteristic' » 89 The Meaning of 'Essentially Attributable to Its Geographical Origin' » 90

#### CHAPTER III

- GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS IN EUROPE, THE UNITED STATES OF
  - AMERICA, AUSTRALIA AND INDIA » 94
  - Geographical Indications Protection in the European
    - Community » 95

      The Legal Bases of Geographical Indication Protection in the European Community » 95
    - The European Union Regulation (EEC) Number 2081,
    - 1992 » 97 The European Union Regulation (EEC) Number 510, 2006 » 99
    - The Importance of the 'Turron' Decision » 100
  - Geographical Indications in France » 101
    - Appellation of Origins in France » 101
    - Geographical Indications in France » 102
    - Indication of Source in France » 103
  - Geographical Indications Protection in the United States of America » 104
    - Certification Marks under the United States Trade Mark Act,1946 » 105
      - Ownership » 107
      - Wines and Spirits Protection under The United States
        Trade Marks Act 1946 and The United States Regulations
        of the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and Firearms
        (ATF) » 108
      - Homonymous Geographical Indications » 109
    - Geographical Indication Protection in the United States
      - Common Law Protection System » 110
    - Law Enforcement for Geographical Indications in the United States Trade Mark Counterfeiting Act, 1984 » 110
  - Geographical Indications Protection System in Australia » 110
    - Australian Membership in International Conventions in respect to Geographical Indications » 111
    - The TRIPS Agreement, 1994 » 112
    - Australia in accordance with Bilateral Agreements regarding
      - Geographical Indications Protection » 112
      - Bilateral Agreement between Australia and The European Union, 1994 » 112

Australia and New Zealand Cooperation Concerning Food Authority Labelling and Advertising Standard » 114 Australian National Protection System for Geographical

Indications » 114

The Australian Trade Practice Act, 1974 (Cth) » 114

The Australian Wine and Brandy Corporation Act, 1980 and the Australian Food Standards Code Spirit Standard » 115

Geographical Indication Protection in the Australian Trade Mark Act, 1995 (Cth) » 116

The Categorization System of Geographical Indications on Goods in regard with the Nice Agreement » 118

Geographical Indications in India » 119

#### CHAPTER IV

GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS IN SOUTH EAST ASIAN COUNTRIES » 128

Geographical Indications in Singapore » 128

Geographical Indications in the Philippines » 130

Geographical Indications in Malaysia » 136

Geographical Indications in Brunei Darussalam » 139

Geographical Indications in Thailand » 140

Geographical Indications in Cambodia » 141

Geographical Indications in Lao People Democratic Republic » 147

Geographical Indications in Myanmar » 150

Geographical Indications in Vietnam » 152

Vietnam's Basic Laws in Protecting Geographical Indications » 153

The Civil Code of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam » 153 The Government Decree Number 63/CP of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam » 155

The Government Decree Number 12/1999/ND-CP of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam » 156

The Government Decree Number 54/2000/ND-CP of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam » 158

#### CHAPTER V

GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS PROTECTION IN INDONESIA » 164

The History of Geographical Indications Protection in Indonesia » 164

Tort in the Republic of Indonesian Civil Code » 165

The Republic of Indonesian Law Number 5, 1999 in relation to Antimonopoly and Unfair Competition » 167

The Republic of Indonesian Consumer Protection Law Number 8, 1999 » 168

The Republic of Indonesian Trade Marks Law Number 15, 2001 » 168

The Bills of Government Regulation concerning the Procedures for Geographical Indication Registration » 173

The First Bill » 173 The Second Bill » 176

The Government Regulation Number 51 Year 2007 of the President of the Republic of Indonesia concerning Geographical Indication » 177

#### **CHAPTER VI**

THE ADVANTAGE OF GEOGRAPHICAL INDICATIONS FOR TRADITIONAL KNOWLEDGE » 188

Traditional Knowledge Protection Problems » 188

Definition of Indigenous People and Their Cultural Expression » 189

Problems of Traditional Knowledge Protection » 192

Form » 192

Originality » 192

Ownership » 194

Duration of Protection » 195

Protection of Spiritual Values » 196

Several Efforts to Solve this Problem » 198

#### CHAPTER VII

THE CONNECTION BETWEEN INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS AND CULTURAL RIGHTS » 202

Cultural Rights in International Laws » 202

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 1948 » 207

The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) » 207

The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)  $\,>\,$  207

The Declaration on the Rights of Development 1986 » 207

The Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) » 208

The International Labour Organization Convention Number 169 » 208

The Draft Declaration on Indigenous Rights » 208

The Historical Context of Cultural Rights and Intellectual Property Rights » 209

Examples of Cultural and Intellectual Property Rights
Cases » 210

The Case of a Patent Right of a Plant Variety as well as a Cultural Right of Traditional Community in Amazon » 210 The Copyright Case and Cultural Right Case of a Group of Australian Aboriginal Painters » 211

The Geographical Indication Case and Cultural Right Case of Haryana Traditional Farmer » 213

Comparing Cultural Rights and Intellectual Property Rights » 214

The Concept of 'Severe Impact' in the Lack of Cultural Right Fulfilment » 215

The Positive Values to connect Cultural Rights with Intellectual Property Rights » 216

#### **CHAPTER VIII**

A CULTURAL RIGHTS BASED APPROACH » 220

Rights Based Approach » 220

Universality, Non-Discrimination and Equality Principle » 221

Indivisibility or Interdependence Principle » 221

Accountability » 221

Participation » 221

The Rule of Law » 222

The Progressive Realization Principle » 222

A Cultural Rights-Based Approach » 223

Modified Rapid Rural Appraisal » 225

General Methodology » 227

Types of Data » 227

Method of Data Collection » 228

Library and On-Line Research » 228

Field Research » 228

Areas of Data Collection » 229

Institutional Data Areas » 229

Market Polling Areas » 229

Focus Group Discussions or Individual Interviews » 229

Methods of Data Analysis » 230

Detailed Methodology » 230

Participants » 232

Justifications for These Amounts » 322

Area of Focus Group » 234

The Number of Participants for the Focus Groups » 235

Selection and Exclusion Criteria for Participants » 235

Procedures » 236

Length of Time » 238

Places of Research » 239

#### CHAPTER IX

FIELD RESEARCH RESULTS IN INDONESIA » 241

#### Market Polling » 241

Hero Supermarket » 242

Matahari Supermarket » 242

Total responses from Hero and Matahari Supermarkets » 244

Total Responses in Percentage » 244

#### Focus Group Discussion and Individual Interviews » 244

Sumbanese Woven Clothes » 245

Traditional Values » 246

The Existence of a Producer Association » 250

The Existence of a Traditional Community Leader » 251

The Map of Sumba Island » 253

Traditional Technology Know-How » 255

Kalimantan Timber » 258

The History of the Products » 260

The Existence of a Traditional Community Leader » 264

The Map of the Area » 268

Traditional Technology Know-How » 268

Pekalongan Batik » 273

The History and Special Character of the Products » 275

The Existence of Producer Associations » 279

The Map of Pekalongan City of Batik » 281

Traditional Technology Know-How » 281

Cilembu Sweet Potatoes » 286

The History of the Product » 288

The Existence of a Producer Association » 290

The Map of the Area » 293

Traditional Technology Know-How » 294

Borobudur Replicas » 296

The History of the Product » 298

The Existence of a Producer Association » 301

The Existence of a Spiritual Community Leader » 302

The Map of the Area » 306

Traditional Technology Know-How » 307

Ubud Painting Style » 309

The History of the Product » 310

The Kamasan Style » 314

The Batuan Style » 314

The Young Artists of Bali Style » 315

The Ubud Style » 315

The Existence of an Association » 316

The Map of the Area » 317

Traditional Technology Know-How » 318

Cakalang Fish » 319

The History of the Product » 320

The Existence of a Producer Association » 322

The Map of the Area » 324 Traditional Technology Know-How » 324

#### CHAPTER X

## FIELD RESEARCH RESULTS IN AUSTRALIA » 330

Goulburn Roses » 330

The History of the Product » 334

The Existence of a Producer Association » 335

The Map of the Area » 336

Traditional Technology Know-How » 337

Coonawarra Wine » 338

The History of the Product » 338

The Existence of a Producer Association » 342

The Map of the Area » 344

Traditional Technology Know-How » 345

#### **CHAPTER XI**

DISCUSSION » 350

Scope of Geographical Indications, Indication of Sources and Appellation of Origins » 350

International Conventions related to Geographical Indications » 356

Controversy on the Protectable Elements of Geographical Indication » 361

# Modes of Legal Means to Implement Geographical Indications » 363

Protection in the National Levels » 361

Inclusive-General Mode » 361

Inclusive Specific Mode » 363

Exclusive Level Mode » 364

Exclusive Non-Level Mode » 365

# Different Legal Means in Selected Countries » 366

The United States of America » 366

The European Community » 367

France » 369

Australia » 370

India » 371

Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand and Cambodia » 371

Singapore » 371

Malaysia » 372

Thailand » 373

Cambodia » 373

The Philippines and Brunei Darussalam » 374

The Philippines » 374

Brunei Darussalam » 374

The Republic of Socialist Vietnam » 375 Laos People Democratic Republic and Myanmar » 9 Laos » 376 Myanmar » 377

Indonesia » 377

#### The Proposed Character of Indonesian Legal Means to Protect Geographical Indications » 377

TRIPS Obligations and the Cultural and Legal Diversity in the South East Asian Countries » 377

Principles in the Republic of Indonesian 1945 Constitution and the Republic of Indonesian Law Number 11, 2005 concerning the Ratification of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights » 380

Contribution of Qualitative Field Research in the Indonesian Selected Areas » 382

Inputs Generated from Qualitative Research in Indonesian Selected Areas » 384

### Analysis of the Field Research Results in Indonesia » 384

National Reputation » 386

History » 388

Producers Associations » 389

Community Leaders » 390

Clustered Areas » 391

Cilembu Sweet Potato Clustered Area of Production » 391
Cakalang Fish Clustered Area of Production » 392
Pekalongan Batik Clustered Area of Production » 392
Ubud Painting Style Clustered Area of Production » 394
Borobudur Replicas Clustered Area of Production » 393
Kalimantan Timber Clustered Area of Production » 394
Sumbanese Woven Clothes Clustered Area of

Production » 394

Traditional Know-How » 395

The Possibility of Protections » 395

Inputs from Qualitative Field Research in the Australian Selected Areas » 396

The Principles of Geographical Indication Protection in Indonesia » 396

Critical Review on the Existing Geographical Indications
Protection System in Indonesia » 397

#### CHAPTER XI

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS » 404
Conclusions » 404
Recommendations » 405

Bibliography » 406

# LIST OF TABLES AND CHARTS

Table of the core of the basic structure of the WTO Agreement

Table of comparison between GIs and DO

The Procedure for Formal Examination

The Procedure of Substantive Examination

The Procedure of Publication

The Procedure of Substantive Re-examination

Areas of focus group discussions and individual interview in Indonesia

Table of selection and exclusion Criteria for participants

Table of procedures

Length of time

Places of research

The results of market polling in Hero Supermarket

The results of market polling in Matahari Supermarket Total responses from Hero and Matahari Supermarket

Total responses in percentage

Scope of GI, IS and AO

International Conventions related to GI

Controversy on the protectable elements

Inclusive-General Mode

Inclusive-Specific Mode

Exclusive-Level Mode

Table of Different Legal Means in Selected Countries

The proposed character of Indonesian legal means to protect GI

Analysis of the field research results in Indonesia

# LIST OF MAPS

Map of field research areas in Indonesia Map of Sumba Island

Map of Kalimantan Island

Map of Pekalongan City

Map of Cilembu Village

Map of Borobudur Temple Zone

Map of Ubud Village

Map of Manado, including Bitung Port

Map of Goulburn Mulwaree area and Goulburn City

Map of the old Coonawarra wine region

Map of the current Coonawarra wine region

Map of clustered area of Cilembu Sweet Potatoes

Map of clustered area of Cakalang Fish

Map of clustered area of Pekalongan Batik

Map of clustered area of Ubud Painting Style

Map of Borobudur Temple zones

Map of clustered area of Kalimantan Timber

Map of clustered area of Sumba Woven Clothes

# LIST OF PICTURES

Picture Number	Theme of Picture
1	West Sumba Woven Clothes
2	West Sumba Woven Clothes for men
3	West Sumba Woven Clothes for women
4	Eastern Sumba Woven Clothes
5	Deborea Dukapare weaving
6	Houses in Tarung Traditional Village
7	Statue of Marapu at the central of Tarung Village
8	Mama Lida Lawu Mude
9	Weaving tools in Tarung Village
10	Cottons of the clothes
11	Tool of 'Pamining'
12-13	'Kabukul's
14	'Karandi'
15	Tightening the threats
16	Tool of 'Wailanga' and 'Kombu'
17-18	Weavings
19	Kalimantan tropical rainforest
20	Ulin Kalimantan Timber
21	<i>'Sampe'</i> instrument of Dayak Kenyah
22	Jahab Traditional Village

23	Osik, the guardian of Dayak Benuaq Adat Law
24-25	'Tempelak'
26	Woman of Dayak Iban
27-29	Pekalongan Batik
30	Modern batik
31	Pekalongan Batik shirts
32	Pekalongan Batik women clothes
33	'Canthing'
34	'batik'-ing or making a piece of hand-written Batik
35	Batik Hokkokai
36	Stamping a piece of fabric into a Batik
37	Waxing process in the hand-written 'batiking'
38	'Mori' has being 'ngerowongi'
39	'dilorot'
40-41	Cilembu Sweet Potatoes plants and the roots
42	Cilembu potatoes as interval plants
43	Office of Sarimukti Farmer Association
44	The end of rice, the beginning of potatoes
45	Stupa in Borobudur Temple
46	Borobudur replica
47	Replica of Borobudur's Budha
48	Small replica of Borobudur Temple
49	Small replica of Borobudur's stupa on an ashtray
50-51	Headless Budha statues in Borobudur Temple
52	Head-only Budha small replicas in the 2nd zone
53	Carving a replica
54	Ubud Painting Style (AAG Sobrat)
55	Kamasan Painting Style
56	Batuan Painting Style
57	Young Artist Painting Style
58	Ubud Painting Style
59	A group of high school students painting
60	Cakalang Fish
61	'Cakalang Fufu'
62	Fish floss

# 20 | MIRANDA RISANG AYU

63 64 65	Fresh Cakalang in Bitung Port  Cakalang and Baby Tuna in Bitung Port  Cakalang Fishermen in Bitung Port
65	Cakalang Fishermen in Bitung Port
66	Fresh Cakalang from the boat's fridge
67	Cakalang in the smoking process
68	Cooked Cakalang in to the traditional storage
69	Chopping a 'Cakalang Fufu'
70	Goulburn Roses at Victoria Park, Goulburn
71	The Rosarians Max and Jane Ryan
72	Various roses in Goulburn
73	The apricot Goulburn Rose
74	Goulburn Roses grow in a cluster
75	Goulburn Roses survived in dry season
76	Red wine
77	Wine grapes in Coonawarra
78	Landscape of the red 'terra rossa' soil
79	The legendary Wynn's Coonawarra cellar doors
80	The plants of Coonawarra wine grapes
81	Various Wyinn's Coonawarra wines
82	The ripe Coonawarra wine grapes
83	Poplar tree, the natural weather stabilizer
84-85	'Terra-rossa' soil
86-87	'Terra-rossa' soil and 'Rendzina' soil
88-91	Coonawarra vague borderlines
92	Wynn's Coonawarra wine industry

#### **ABSTRACT**

eographical Indications in the Agreement of Trade-Related Aspects on Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) is an Intellectual Property Rights subject matter identifying a geographical origin of a product which serves the product with a special character. Although obligatory, TRIPS Agreement provides its members with flexibility to establish a Geographical Indications protection system in their national levels.

As a member of TRIPS Agreement, Indonesia has been attempting to provide a national protection for Geographical Indication in accordance with TRIPS Agreement. This research was intended to evaluate the existing Indonesian legal protection system by using the Cultural Rights Approach to propose the more appropriate model for Geographical Indication protection in Indonesia.

This research used textual data to analyse and compare a number of international laws related to geographical origins and several established protection models in selected countries. Besides that, contextual data were obtained from seven places in Indonesia and two places in Australian to understand the real problems and to accommodate the real interests from the fields.

The result of this research proves that Specific Level Mode of Geographical Indication protection is the most suitable model of protection system for Indonesia.